

Cooperative Monitoring, Evaluation and Research Committee

Tuesday, February 27, 2024 // 9:00AM – 3:50PM

Virtual Only

Motions	
Motion	Move/Second (Vote)
<p>January 2024 Meeting Minutes</p> <p><u>Motion:</u> Mark Meleason moved to approve the January 2024 minutes with following edits.</p> <p>The motion passed</p>	<p>Seconded: Aimee McIntyre</p> <p>Up: Welles Bretherton, Debbie Kay, Harry Bell, Aimee McIntyre, Mark Meleason, Chris Mendoza, Hans Berge, A.J. Kroll, Julie Dieu, and Ash Roorbach (proxy for Mark Mobbs)</p> <p>Abstain: Jenny Knoth (Absent at last meeting)</p> <p>Absent: Doug Martin</p>
<p>Unstable Slopes Criteria Projects 3 and 4 Project Management Plan</p> <p><u>Motion:</u> Aimee McIntyre moved to approve the Unstable Slopes Criteria Projects 3 and 4 Project Management Plan.</p> <p>The motion passed</p>	<p>Seconded: Welles Bretherton</p> <p>Up: Debbie Kay, Mark Meleason, Harry Bell, Welles Bretherton, Julie Dieu, A.J. Kroll, Aimee McIntyre, Jenny Knoth, Chris Mendoza, Hans Berge (proxy is Chris Mendoza), Ash Roorbach (Proxy for Mark Mobbs).</p>
<p>Roads Project Request for an Increase in FY24 and FY25 Budget</p> <p><u>Motion:</u> Chris Mendoza moved that CMER approve the request for additional funds to continue the Road Prescription-scale project as proposed by the project team with the addition of alternative budget scenarios with the associated implications for meeting project timeline deliverables, but prioritizing maintaining critical field components of the ongoing main experiment.</p> <p>The motion passed</p>	<p>Seconded: Jenny Knoth</p> <p>Up: Debbie Kay, Mark Meleason, Harry Bell, Welles Bretherton, Julie Dieu, A.J. Kroll, Aimee McIntyre, Jenny Knoth, Chris Mendoza, Hans Berge, Ash Roorbach (Proxy for Mark Mobbs).</p>
<p>Outside Science</p> <p><u>Motion:</u> Jenny Knoth moved to continue the development of guidance for the non-CMER science using the memo provided to CMER as a framework.</p> <p>The motion failed</p>	<p>Seconded: Mark Meleason</p> <p>Up: Mark Meleason, Doug Martin, Aimee McIntyre, Harry Bell, Jenny Knoth, A.J. Kroll, and Julie Dieu.</p> <p>Down:</p>

<p>CMER's Dispute Resolution process was invoked.</p>	<p>Chris Mendoza, Ash Roorbach (Proxy for Mark Mobbs), Welles Bretherton, Debbie Kay. Abstain: Hans Berge</p>
<p>Anadromous Fish Floor (AFF) Project Team</p> <p>Motion: Julie Dieu moved to approve the Anadromous Fish Floor (AFF) Project Team as proposed.</p> <p>The motion passed</p>	<p>Seconded: Jenny Knoth Up: Debbie Kay, Mark Meleason, Harry Bell, Welles Bretherton, Julie Dieu, A.J. Kroll, Aimee McIntyre, Jenny Knoth, Chris Mendoza, Hans Berge, Ash Roorbach (Proxy for Mark Mobbs).</p>
<p>Schedule L-1 Prioritization Memo</p> <p>Motion: Aimee McIntyre moved to approve the Table and associated recommendations based on the workgroup memo, with one change: change the fines/gravel review category to green (a priority for review). [I think we can figure out how to handle this with SME later when we get to step 3].</p> <p>The motion passed</p>	<p>Seconded: Jenny Knoth Up: Debbie Kay, Mark Meleason, Harry Bell, Welles Bretherton, Julie Dieu, A.J. Kroll, Aimee McIntyre, Jenny Knoth, Chris Mendoza, Hans Berge, Ash Roorbach (Proxy for Mark Mobbs).</p>
<p>Eastside Timber Habitat Evaluation Project (ETHEP) Prospective 6 Questions</p> <p>Motion: Aimee McIntyre moved to approve the ETHEP Prospective 6 Questions.</p> <p>The motion passed</p>	<p>Seconded: Welles Bretherton Up: Debbie Kay, Mark Meleason, Harry Bell, Welles Bretherton, Julie Dieu, A.J. Kroll, Aimee McIntyre, Jenny Knoth, Chris Mendoza, Hans Berge, Ash Roorbach (Proxy for Mark Mobbs).</p>

Action Items	
Action Items	Responsibility
Bring a list of what was completed for the response to ISPR for the Westside Type F Exploratory report to next month's CMER meeting.	Jenelle Black
Westside Type F Exploratory Report update.	March CMER Meeting
Schedule the informal meeting within 30-days as the next step in the dispute resolution for Outside Science.	Lori Clark/Natalie Church

Welcome, Introductions, & Old Business

A.J. Kroll, CMER co-chair

Natalie Church took roll call

Ground Rules

- A.J. Kroll read “Participate in a constructive manner”.
- Julie Dieu “Be realistic in your availability and ability to carry out action items”.

Staff Updates

- Natalie Church is working behind the scenes to come up with a new format for Adaptive Management Program mailings to make it more streamlined and easier for participants. It is the same format the Forest Practices Board uses. CMER participants will automatically be added to this distribution list. Natalie will start using this new system for the March CMER meeting. CMER participants will receive an email from GovDelivery. Natalie will still send CMER voting members an email with SPO links for CMER meeting materials.
- RSVP has closed for the April 9-10th Structured Decision-Making workshop for all Adaptive Management Program participants. Alex McInturff and Sarah Converse with Washington Cooperative Fish and Wildlife Research Unit at the University of Washington will be hosting. It will be a two-day all-day workshop at the NRB. Lori to check on possibility of recording the workshop.
- Document commenting etiquette – Lori shared that she sent an email to SAG co-chairs letting them know expectations around respectful tone as well as productive comments. Project Managers will remove disrespectful comments and ask the participant to reframe in a professional tone.
- Natalie shared information on a webinar series co-sponsored by the Washington Chapter of the Wildlife Society and NCASI, titled: “Fire Ecology and Forest Resilience in the Pacific Northwest”.

Public Comments

No public comments

TFW Policy Updates

Brandon Austin gave an update on what was discussed at the February 2024 Timber Fish and Wildlife (TFW) Policy Committee meeting.

Document Commenting Etiquette

Lori Clark covered this agenda item during the staff updates.

Westside Type F Exploratory Report Update

Westside Type F Exploratory Report will be reported this year to the Board as being non-compliant with the HCP as it has fallen 4 years behind schedule. Jenelle Black is going to report the status of the ISPR response, including sections that are still pending and plans to accomplish those tasks. Jenelle is scheduled to report each month on progress. CMER may need to find ways to support Jenelle to get the author response to ISPR completed. Jenelle shared her screen and reviewed the Westside Type F Exploratory Study ISPR response plan spreadsheet which included the major reviewer comment themes, response summaries to the reviewers, and the status. A.J. Kroll requested that Jenelle come back next month with a list of what she was able to complete. No timeline or proposed due date was discussed.

Protocol and Standards Manual (PSM) Sections 9 and 10

Lori Clark shared her screen and reviewed the unaddressed comments and edits on sections 9 & 10. This

will be a decision item next month.

Unstable Slopes Criteria Projects 3 and 4 Project Management Plan

Theryn Henkel shared her screen and reviewed the major changes to the Project Management Plan as they are getting prepared for implementation. She answered questions as they came up and did a minor live update stating that the project's continuation is contingent on the Forest Practices Board approval of funding.

Outside Science

Lori Clark explained CMER is reviewing a guidance document for how to evaluate outside science, "Evaluation Process for incorporation of non-CMER Science into the Forest Practices Adaptive Management Program." Policy is charged with determining under what scenario we would bring in Outside Science. Policy is working on guidance for if and when conditions or situations would warrant the use of outside science to be used in AMP decision making and determining whether it could be subjected to the dispute resolution process. The timeline has been adjusted to allow time for TFW Policy to work this out and get it right. CMER is tasked with continuing to make progress on the process document that will articulate how one could evaluate outside science if and when Policy may request as much.

Chris Mendoza explained that he wrote a new document, as he had mentioned wanting to do previously at the January CMER meeting, and he understands that he sent it in after the established 30-day comment deadline has passed. The way he views the PSM is that this document is up for approval today because it states that there is an action listed on the agenda. He explained that CMER already has a PI (proposal initiation) process, and we don't need to reinvent the wheel. A.J. explained that the ask for today's meeting is to discuss the edits/comments received on the guidance for the non-CMER science memo that was distributed on January 16th for review and comment and get consensus about which suggested edits the co-chairs should respond to with revisions. Aimee McIntyre explained that her understanding is that the memo is not to replace what is already in the PSM. Hans Berge suggested opening this up for CMER to work on collectively like they had done in the past. Aimee McIntyre explained that is what we are doing now. Lori shared her screen and went through each one of the comments to see if CMER agreed that it is a comment that the co-chairs need to address when they revise the document. Ash Roorbach suggested a combined TFW Policy and CMER workgroup to discuss this document. Doug Martin explained that CMER should be giving TFW Policy an objective approach to this so then TFW Policy can make a decision on whether they should accept outside science or not. A.J. Kroll asked Lori what needs to happen to invoke dispute. Hans explained that there needs to be a vote to call dispute on. A.J. invoked dispute resolution after the motion to continue work on the outside science document failed. Lori Clark explained that the next step in dispute resolution is that an informal meeting needs to be convened within 30 days of when dispute resolution was invoked. She suggested that Chris Mendoza's document be shared with CMER members who will attend the Informal Meeting. Lori explained that an email will be distributed with scheduling information and any CMER member who does not wish to participate should respond to the email as such. The CMER members that posted in the chat saying they wanted to participate are Aimee McIntyre, Chris Mendoza, Jenny Knoth, and Westside tribes will participate, Ash will be Debbie Kay's proxy for this topic. Jenny Knoth explained that she would like to have it noted that she is disappointed that this process is being handled in the way it is and she appreciates a dispute being called.

Roads Project Review and CMER Guidance

CMER is the oversight committee for the Roads project and in this capacity is now scheduled to receive

monthly project updates from Jenelle Black, Julie Dieu, and/or Alexander Prescott. Alexander gave a presentation that included a project update for CMER to be informed on the project status, timeline, and FY24-25 budget deficit. Alexander requested that CMER consider approving a request to be sent to Policy for increased funding to cover increased implementation costs. Lori explained that what is being asked today is getting CMER’s endorsement to request TFW Policy for an increase in budget since CMER is the oversight committee for this project. It is ultimately up to TFW Policy to decide where the money would come from. The motion passed and Alexander will relay the motion to TFW Policy ahead of the March meeting. CMER members shared an interest in ensuring that requested funds were identified from either unspent funds or projects that were not yet in implementation.

Anadromous Fish Floor (AFF) Project Team

Anna Toledo explained that CMER assigned the AFF project to ISAG last August and at the December CMER meeting CMER requested that ISAG winnow the project team to be consistent with the PSM. The proposed project team was approved.

Schedule L-1 Prioritization Memo

Theryn Henkel gave a brief explanation of what has been asked of the Schedule L-1 workgroup and what is being asked of CMER today, which is to approve the prioritization memo. Doug Martin suggested to write down in the memo what is being asked of the SME groups that will be formed. Theryn shared the Schedule L-1 table for prioritization on her screen and CMER discussed whether they agreed with how the workgroup prioritized the list. There was discussion on whether to change the color coding of the “Fines in Gravel”. Harry Bell explained his thoughts on why he wanted to add text regarding uncertainty. Theryn pasted Harry’s proposed verbiage into the chat, then she explained that the rest of the workgroup did not agree with the statement as written, and that the inclusion of a statement about scientific uncertainty did not belong in this memo. The workgroup will address this uncertainty with the specific questions that we ask the SME to answer by using all best available science. Harry explained that the next step needs to include his concern, or it will go to dispute resolution. Lori explained that there was some disagreement after the last Schedule L-1 workgroup meeting in regard to the text that Harry had just discussed. The Project Team did not support the proposed language and since there was not another Project Team meeting scheduled to come to a consensus agreement, she gave direction for Theryn to provide the memo in the CMER mailing without that language included. It was clarified that the request before CMER today was restricted to the table of resource and functional objectives provided in the memo and the categories to which each was assigned. With that in mind, CMER approved the memo.

Eastside Timber Habitat Evaluation Project (ETHEP) Prospective 6 Questions

Jenny Schofield gave a brief explanation of what is being asked of CMER today, which is approval of the Prospective 6 Questions. Jenny did live updates to accommodate Aimee McIntyre’s suggested edit under question 2 and Harry Bell’s suggested edit under question 5. Rachel Rubin agreed to both edits. Jenny explained that this document would be delivered to TFW Policy following CMER approval.

CMER SAG Updates:

Each SAG reviewed the CMER SAG updates document, which was updated live as needed.

List of Attendees

Attendees	Representing
§Bell, Harry	WFFA– Small Forest Landowners
§Berge, Hans	UCUT – Eastern Washington Tribes

§Bretherton, Welles	Department of Ecology
§Dieu, Julie	Rayonier
§Kay, Debbie	Suquamish Tribe
§Knoth, Jenny	Washington Farm Forestry Association
§Kroll, A.J.	CMER Co-Chair
§Martin, Doug	Washington Forest Protection Association
§McIntyre, Aimee	Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife/CMER Co-Chair
§Meleason, Mark	Counties Caucus
§Mendoza, Chris	Conservation Caucus
Austin, Brandon	WDFW/TFW Policy Co-chair
Black, Jenelle	NWIFC CMER Scientist
Church, Natalie	DNR – CMER Coordinator
Clark, Lori	Adaptive Management Program Administrator
Freeman, Elise	CMER Scientist
Harris, Catherine	NWIFC
Henkel, Theryn	DNR Supervisory Project Manager
Heimburg, John	WDFW Habitat Program
Holy, Shae	Skokomish Tribe
Hooks, Doug	WFPA
Kautz, Kyle	Oregon Independent Research
Mitchell, Robert	Member of the Public
Murray, Joe	Washington Forest Protection Association
Prescott, Alexander	DNR Project Manager
Robbins, Jeff	Department of Ecology
Roorbach, Ash	Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission (Proxy for Mark Mobbs)
Rubin, Rachel	CMER Scientist
Schofield, Jenny	DNR Project Manager
Terry, Chris	Oregon Independent Research
Toledo, Anna	DNR Project Manager
Tuttle, Meghan	Forest Practices Board
Venneman, Nikki	Suquamish Tribe
Walter, Jason	ISAG co-chair
Williamson, Tanner	CMER Scientist

§CMER Voting Member