

Cooperative Monitoring Evaluation and Research Committee (CMER)
February 27, 2018
DNR/DOC Industrial Park, Tumwater WA

Attendees	Representing
§Baldwin, Todd (ph)	Kalispel Tribe
§Bell, Harry	Washington Farm Forestry Association
Berge, Hans	Adaptive Management Program Administrator
chesney, charles	Member of the Public
§Dieu, Julie	Rayonier
Davis, Emily	Northwest Indian Fish Commission – CMER Staff
Ehinger, Bill	Department of Ecology
Gibbs, Heather	Department of Natural Resources
Haemmerle, Howard	Department of Natural Resources
§Hicks, Mark	Department of Ecology
Hawkins, Chuck (ph)	Utah State University
Hooks, Doug	Washington Forest Protection Association – CMER Co-Chair
Johnson, Angela	Department of Natural Resources
§Kay, Debbie (ph)	Suquamish Tribe
§Knoth, Jenny	Green Crow - CMER Co-Chair
Link, Tim (ph)	University of Idaho
§Martin, Doug	Washington Forest Protection Association
McIntyre, Aimee	Department of Fish and Wildlife
§Mendoza, Chris	Conservation Caucus
Miskovic, Teresa	Department of Natural Resources
Murray, Joe	Washington Forest Protection Association
Roorbach, Ash	Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission
Schuett-Hames, Dave	Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission - CMER Staff
Shramek, Patti	Department of Natural Resources – CMER Coordinator
Stephens, Rob (ph)	Spokane Tribe of Indians
Stewart, Greg (ph)	Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission – CMER Staff
Swanson, Scott (ph)	Washington State Association of Counties
Teply, Mark	Cramer Fish Sciences
Walter, Jason	Weyerhaeuser

§Indicates official CMER members and alternates; (ph) indicates attended via phone.

*Indicates Decision

Science Session:

CMER Science Conference Presentations – *recommendations and prioritization

- ◆ Patti Shramek reviewed the possible science conference presentations and made edits with the committee’s input. She will send out the list of the agreed upon presentations and PIs will get back to her with amount of time needed for each presentation.

Decisions:

CMER

- ◆ ***CMER Meeting Minutes – approval of December 2017 and January 2018 minutes**
 - Chris Mendoza moved to approve the December 2017 meeting minutes, Julie Dieu seconded – **Approved**
 - Harry Bell moved to approve the January 2018 meeting minutes, Mark Hicks seconded – **Approved**

- ◆ ***2017 CMER Accomplishments – approval**

Aimee McIntyre moved to approve the 2017 CMER Accomplishments document, Jenny Knoth seconded – **Approved**

LWAG

- ◆ ***Hard Rock Phase-2 Extended Report Format – approval**

Howard Haemmerle gave an overview of the report format process up to this point. Hans Berge reviewed the recommendations that he gave to the PIs with the committee. Discussion revolved around how much of the methods from the original study to include in the extended report, organization of the report, and how to pull it all together with multiple authors.

Bell moved to adopt the changes, Doug Martin seconded – **Approved**

- ◆ ***Hard Rock Findings Report – approval**

McIntyre reviewed the request and asked for approval. Haemmerle stressed that this is for Phase I. Mendoza expressed concern with certain portions of the HCP and the findings report without providing context. McIntyre replied that those were added because other reviewers had requested this to be added. She feels like the PIs are chasing a moving target. Schuett-Hames concurred with McIntyre. Knoth remarked that this is a process issue and needs to be addressed, but perhaps CMER should approve this findings report and add the topic to a future agenda.

Mark Hicks moved to approve, Martin seconded – **Approved**

Next Steps: Findings report content will be discussed at a future meeting.

SAGE

- ◆ ***Findings Report for the Fire Salvage Literature Review and Synthesis – approval**
Angela Johnson reviewed the request and asked for approval. Mendoza remarked that CMER had agreed to take out references to individual CMER members, but one was left in. Todd Baldwin said he would take it out.

Mendoza approved with a bullet removed from the section, Hicks seconded - **Approved**

RSAG

- ◆ ***Riparian Characteristics and Shade Response Study – request for reviewers**
Joe Murray reviewed request and asked for reviewers. Knoth, Dieu, and Baldwin will review. Comments are due to Angela Johnson by March 30, 2018.

ISAG

- ◆ ***Fish/Habitat Detection Using eDNA Project – request for approval of proposed work.**
Haemmerle reviewed the request and asked for approval of proposed work. Knoth reviewed the changes, which included additional information to the proposed work, and answered questions. Historically, eDNA and eFishing have never been done at the same time. This proposal combines them at the same time (eDNA first, then eFishing a day or two later).

Discussion revolved around what value this work would add to AMP and other studies that it could inform.

Martin moved to approve, Dieu seconded, Hicks neutral - **Approved**

Next steps: Goes to Policy then to Board for approval. Haemmerle will put together Charter to present to Policy. Policy could chose to use unspent money or contingency funds to move forward with project and go to Board in May to change the name in the Master Project Schedule.

Road Prescription-Scale Effectiveness Monitoring Project TWIG

- ◆ ***Post ISPR Study Design, Prospective Findings Report, Implementation Plan, and Revised Budget – approval**
Haemmerle and Dieu reviewed all parts of the request and asked for approval.

Mendoza moved to approve the ISPR Study Design, Martin seconded – **Approved**

Hicks moved to approve the Findings Report, Bell seconded – **Approved**

Hicks moved to approve the Implementation Plan, Martin seconded – **Approved**
Discussion revolved and where this lands for implementation, a SAG or CMER.

Next Steps: Communication plan will be submitted to CMER at March meeting.

Haemmerle and Heather Gibbs are the PMs for implementation and Charlie Luce is the PI.

Westside Type F Riparian Prescription Monitoring TWIG

- ◆ ***Prospective Findings Report, Implementation Plan, Revised Budget** – *approval*
Haemmerle reviewed the request and asked for approval. Mendoza reviewed the decision to reduce to four questions and asked to have Policy weigh in on this new format.

Bell moved to approve the prospective findings report, McIntyre seconded - **Approved**

Bell moved to adopt the Implementation recommendation given that RSAG will give further input on project team members and their roles, Roorbach seconded – **Approved**

Eastside Type N Riparian Effectiveness Project (ENREP) TWIG

- ◆ ***Combined Study Design, Prospective Findings Report, and Implementation Recommendations** – *approval*

Haemmerle reviewed the requests and history of the project and asked for approval. (At the October 2017 CMER meeting, CMER gave direction to the TWIG to combine wet and dry and work with ISPR on the combination of the two studies. Mendoza remarked that he thought the budget would be lower since they were combined, but that doesn't seem to be the case. Mark Teply replied that the recommendation to combine was because wet and dry sites occur in the same basins. Martin asked how this process worked since CMER didn't see the combined Study Design before it went to ISPR and expressed concern that CMER didn't get to see the ISPR comments. He remarked that it doesn't test lower cost alternatives as requested by Industry and that it doesn't clarify how many lower cost options will be tested. He also remarked that he doesn't think you can do BACI study how study is designed. He feels the applicability is a non-starter. He also expressed concern that about having enough sites. TWIG members addressed the comments and Mark Teply stated that he was confident that the BACI design would work for this.

Mendoza remarked that CMER agreed to have TWIG work with ISPR to combine the studies at the October 2017 meeting.

Hicks remarked that he would like to save costs, but the Study Design needs to focus on testing rules above alternatives. He also noted that CMER has never have sites before study starts, and

that the TWIG has already done some work in identifying and selecting sites. Why is having sites pre-selected a requirement now and why is the project being held up because of it.

Bell expressed his concern that there was a lower cost treatment included before the Study Design went to ISPR, but it isn't included in the final product. WFFA wanted to see a lower cost treatment than was in rule, but still provided protection. They would like to see temperature collection downstream. He is concerned that the PI's and ISPR negotiated without oversight.

It was noted that the ISPR response matrix wasn't sent out, so the reviewers didn't get to see the ISPR comments and how they were addressed. The matrix will be sent out for review.

Mendoza moved to approve the ISPR approved combined Study Design, Roorbach seconded.

Roll call voting:

A.J. Kroll – not present

Chris Mendoza – yes

Debbie Kay, abstain (Roorbach in proxy)

Doug Martin – no

Harry Bell – no

Jenny Knoth – yes – but would still like to review the ISPR comments

Julie Dieu – abstain until review of the ISPR comments.

Mark Hayes – abstain until review of the ISPR comments (McIntyre in proxy)

Mark Mobbs – not present

Todd Baldwin – yes – but would still like to review the ISPR comments

Dieu remarked that if issues with the Study Design are a science issue then it stays in CMER, if they are a Policy issue then it needs to go to Policy. Policy discussion needs to stay out of CMER.

Next steps: Shramek will distribute the comment matrix and a meeting will be set up with the TWIG to go over the ISPR comments before the next meeting CMER meeting. The Study Design will be on the March agenda for approval.

Discussion:

RSAG

◆ Riparian Literature Synthesis

Murray reported that RSAG was asked to take over the Riparian Literature Synthesis and that it didn't go through proper channels. Berge, Johnson, and Murray will meet to discuss how to proceed before next RSAG meeting. Mendoza remarked that Policy should send the request to CMER, and then CMER assigns to RSAG with instructions.

Next Steps: Hooks will request that Policy give CMER the assignment for RSAG (in writing, stating how do they want to use it, and the time frame for completion).

Updates:

- ◆ **Report from Board** – *February 13 & 14, 2018 meetings*
Forest Practices Board meeting minutes are located on the Department of Natural Resources web page at <https://www.dnr.wa.gov/about/boards-and-councils/forest-practices-board>.
- ◆ **Report from Policy** – *February 1, 2018 meetings*
Timber Fish & Wildlife Policy meeting minutes are located on the Department of Natural Resources web page at <http://www.dnr.wa.gov/about/boards-and-councils/forest-practices-board/tfw-policy-committee>.

Public Comment Period

charles chesney remarked that he didn't appreciate having to wait until the end of the meeting to comment, and that CMER should follow the open public meetings act and record the meeting. He remarked that it has been six years since the Forest Hydrology Study was conducted and wondered why it was not used for ENREP.

Recap of Assignments/Decisions approved

- ◆ Patti Shramek will send out list of presentations for science conference. PIs will get back to her with amount of time needed for each presentation.
- ◆ December 2017 and January 2018 CMER meeting minutes approved.
- ◆ 2017 CMER Accomplishments approved to send to Policy.
- ◆ Type N Hard Rock Extended Report format approved.
- ◆ Type N Hard Rock Findings Report approved.
- ◆ Content of Findings Reports to be discussed at March meeting.
- ◆ Fire Salvage Findings Report approved.
- ◆ Comments on Riparian Characteristics and Shade Response Study due to Angela Johnson March 30.
- ◆ Fish/Habitat Detection Using eDNA Project proposed work approved.
- ◆ Road Prescription-Scale Effectiveness Monitoring Project TWIG Post ISPR Study Design, Prospective Findings Report, Implementation Plan, and Revised Budget approved.
- ◆ ENREP ISPR comment matrix will be sent out and a meeting will be set up with the TWIG to go over the ISPR comments before the March CMER meeting.
- ◆ Westside Type F Riparian Prescription Monitoring TWIG Prospective Findings Report, Implementation Plan, and revised budget approved.

- ◆ Doug Hooks will request that Policy give CMER the Riparian Literature Synthesis assignment for RSAG (in writing, stating how do they want to use it, and the time frame for completion).

Adjourned